

D. PANIAGUA- M. A. ANDRÉS-SANZ (eds.), *Formas de acceso al saber en la Antigüedad Tardía y la Alta Edad Media. La transmisión del conocimiento dentro y fuera de la escuela*, Turnhout: Brepols Publishers, 2016, xi+311 pp., ISBN 978-2-503-56987-1.

One of the most fascinating topics that bridge Late Antiquity and the Middle Ages is the transmission of culture from the former to the latter. In the broadest sense it includes not only texts but also art and architecture. Two monographs that come to mind that paved the way on the theme of transmission of knowledge are: the magisterial seminal work of Pierre Riché, *Education and Culture in the Barbarian West: From the Sixth through the Eighth Century* (trans. John J. Contreni) University of South Carolina, 1976 and recently, the superb study of Yitzhak Hen, *Romans Barbarians: The Royal Court and Culture in the Early Medieval West*, Palgrave, 2012. These monographs meticulously chronicle the role of monasticism and monarchies in the transmission of classical culture to the Middle Ages. Riché chronicles the activity of monastic centers or 'schools' where this work took place; the Hen volume focuses on the active role of several barbarian monarchs in promoting literary culture in their respective kingdoms to preserve and transmit classical culture, mainly literary but in some cases art and architecture. Even though this theme has received much attention by scholars, there is still an immense amount of work left to be done. We have only started to tap this rich field of study at every level. Our present collection of essays contributes to this topic but only through internal scrutiny of texts, paleography, stemma of texts, and language. The essays are expertly presented, their analysis solid, and their diverse conclusions compelling. Anyone who intends to engage this volume must have a very good reading knowledge of Spanish, Italian, French, and English. It will also require a good knowledge of Latin, paleography, and the historical background that is assumed by the authors. For specialists this will not be a problem.

The volume is dedicated to the eminent philologist at the University of Salamanca, Carmen Codoñer. The two editors are also at the University of Salamanca: David Paniagua is a 'Ramón y Cajal' researcher in the Department of Classical and Indoeuropean Philology at the University of Salamanca and María Adelaida Andrés Sanz is Titular professor of Latin Philology in the Department of Classical and Indoeuropean Philology at the University of Salamanca. The findings were presented at an international symposium on the topic in question held at the University of Salamanca, October 2014, under the direction of the editors of this volume David Paniagua and María Adelaida Andrés - Sanz. The editors indicate that the common denominator

is the exploration of a variety of texts that reflect a rich cultural background. In addition, their material transmission as preserved in manuscripts and the environments (school or not) in which this took place.

In the words of the editors the essays have as their object to deepen certain aspects of Late Antique and Early Medieval Latin texts that are related to the transmission of knowledge. The subject matter of the volume has very little for the historian with the exception of one essay by Paolo Chiesa, “Studenti di greco? Carlo Magno e Liutprando.” The rest, however, will be of great interest to philologists, paleographers, and cognate fields. The essays range in subject matter, there are pre – Christian late antique texts, some from the Church Fathers, several in the Carolingian period, two on Isidore of Seville, and others whose focus is manuscripts.

The book contains the following essays: David Paniagua y M.<sup>a</sup> Adelaida Andrés Sanz, “Introducción.” Carmen Codoñer, “El tratamiento de la palabra en latín.” Carlos Lévy, “La transmisión del escepticismo en la tradición filosófica romana.” Marisa Squillante, “L’ambiguità della parola in Agostino.” Luigi Pirovano, “Alcune considerazioni sulla «protostoria» delle *Interpretationes Vergilianae* di Tiberio Claudio Donato.” Giovanni Polara, “Scrivere e leggere: scritture esposte non convenzionali.” Massimo Gioseffi, “Ancora su Coronato e *Viuo equidem uitamque extrema per omnia duco* (AL 223 R.<sup>2</sup>=214 Sh.B.).” David Paniagua, “Nuovi e vecchi testimoni manoscritti delle *Voces uariae animantium* di Polemio Silvio.” Paulo F. Alberto, “Corippus’ Panegyric of Justin II in Carolingian Grammatical Texts.” Jacques Elfassi, “Nouvelles sources augustinienes dans le premier livre des *Différences* d’Isidore de Séville.” Rodrigo Furtado, “A collection of chronicles from Late Antique Spain: Madrid, Complutense 134, ff. 25vb–47vb. Content, structure and chronology.” Paolo Chiesa, “Studenti di greco? Carlo Magno e Liutprando.” M.<sup>a</sup> Adelaida Andrés Sanz, “*De notis et signis*. Algunas cuestiones sobre el léxico de la *Praefatio in psalterium* atribuida a Isidoro de Sevilla.” We can locate the studies by subject in the following broad categories: Language (Gioseffi, Polara, Codoñer, Chiesa, Squillante, Andrés Sanz; Manuscripts (Furtado and Alberto); Transmission (Pirovano, Lévy, Paniagua, Furtado, Alberto, and Elfassi).

There are a few shortcomings in the volume overall that I would like to signal. What is sorely lacking in the majority of the essays, save one, is the historical context where this learning took place. The brief ‘presentation’ is of no use in explaining how the essays specifically are intended to advance the agenda suggested in the title. Equally absent is a conclusion by the editors to tie together these studies to articulate what overall has been accomplished to deepen our understanding of the transmission of knowledge. Then there is the ambiguous last line in the title, *La transmisión del conocimiento dentro y fuera de la escuela*. The editors never explain what is meant by ‘escuela – school,’ the reader is left wondering. The transmission of knowledge that

is explored in the studies never indicate if it occurred within a 'school.' It would have been helpful, if it was clarified what is meant by a school! Do they mean centers of learning or even perhaps a school of thought; we are left in the dark! An explanation in the opening section on what places of learning looked like in Late Antiquity and the Early Middle Ages where this transmission of knowledge took place would have gone a long way to clear this up. Another missing element that is common in the majority of books of essays is a summary of the article in a language other than the one it is written. I would like to make clear that these concerns do not in any way undermine the high quality of these studies; the authors have executed essays of the highest order.

Each essay has a complete bibliography of sources consulted that reflect a good knowledge of their topic and that they read broadly the research of scholars from diverse countries. The book is accompanied with an index of authors and texts and an index of manuscripts. FIDEM and Brepols are to be lauded for the publication of this volume and the authors for the time dedicated to produce these highly informative studies.

ALBERTO FERREIRO  
Seattle Pacific University  
beto@spu.edu

